

HUMBOLDT-UNIVERSITÄT ZU BERLIN

Landwirtschaftlich-Gärtnerische Fakultät

Schriftenreihe des Seminars für Ländliche Entwicklung



## Approaches to Reduce Youth Poverty in Cape Town, South Africa



**SLE** CENTRE FOR ADVANCED TRAINING IN RURAL DEVELOPMENT



Gabriele Zdunnek (teamleader), Christian Cray, Britta Lambertz, Nathalie Licht, Eva Rux

Approaches to Reduce Youth Poverty in Cape Town, South Africa. Berlin, 2003

## SUMMARY

### 1 Introduction

Since the 1990s, the United Nations (UN) policies and strategies as well as those of national and international development agencies have stressed the importance of recognising the problems and potential of youth. The *Agenda 21* of the 1992 *Rio World Summit* called for “activities aimed at reducing current levels of youth unemployment” and urged non-governmental organisations (NGOs) to “develop education and awareness programmes specifically targeted at the youth population on critical issues” as a prerequisite for sustainable development.<sup>1</sup> The main arguments for a stronger involvement in policies and strategies targeting young people are as follows:

- Youth poverty, unemployment, and exclusion from decision-making processes are widespread and intensifying. According to estimates of the International Labour Organisation (ILO), more than 40 percent of the total unemployed population are currently young people (ILO 2003).
- The HIV/AIDS infection rate is especially high among young people, increasing long-term poverty risks for societies on a local and national level.
- Children and youth are often victims of abuse, exploitation and violence. At the same time, however, they are also progressively involved in violent and criminal behaviour, in extreme cases as child soldiers or gang members.
- In developing countries in particular, young people represent a large proportion of the total population. As a result of their enormous potential for human and social development, they are regarded as ‘part of the solution rather than the problem’ and as potential ‘change agents’.<sup>2</sup>

In the strategies for poverty reduction and sustainable development in the UN *Millennium Declaration*, special attention was given to children and youth. Some of the *Millennium Development Goals* address children and youth directly, such as the improvement of education, an increase in employment opportunities, promotion of gender equality, and HIV/AIDS prevention.<sup>3</sup> The *Youth Employment Network* was con-

---

<sup>1</sup> Chapter 25, [www.developmentgoals.org/](http://www.developmentgoals.org/)

<sup>2</sup> La Cava, Gloria and Lytle, Paula 2003: Youth – strategic directions for the World Bank, draft

<sup>3</sup> [www.developmentgoals.org/](http://www.developmentgoals.org/)

vened under the leadership of the World Bank and ILO, to develop 'imaginative approaches' to the issues of youth unemployment.<sup>4</sup>

The growing awareness of the problems and potential of youth was reflected at a number of global conferences, as well as in the formulation of their rights to education, employment and health, as stated in a variety of international instruments and action programmes. The *United Nations World Action Programme for Youth* of 2000, for example, aims above all at increasing opportunities for youth participation in decision-making processes. It seeks to make governments more responsive to their aspirations and potential. At the fourth *World Youth Forum* in Dakar in 2001, organised by the United Nations, it was stated that effective communication channels between NGOs and the UN system are essential for dialogue and consultation on activities and programmes designed for the empowerment of youth. The *Forum's* working group on youth employment called for training relevant to work in the formal and informal sector and for cooperation between employers and training providers. With reference to the ILO *Declaration on Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work*, the participants recommended that working conditions for young people should be improved, their rights promoted, and their voice and representation at work acknowledged. Various countries, UN agencies and NGOs have made progress in creating awareness of youth issues. However, the wide fragmentation of youth policies and programmes makes it difficult to assess their impact.<sup>5</sup>

Since the end of the 1990s, German development cooperation has also emphasised the importance of youth promotion in its projects and programmes. In 1997, the *Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development* (BMZ), the *German Agency for Technical Cooperation* (GTZ), and NGOs published a strategy paper stating that the interests of children and young people shall be considered a general, cross-cutting task of Development Cooperation. In its *Action Programme 2015*, BMZ formulates ten strategies for halving extreme poverty worldwide by the year 2015. These include:

- "boosting the economy and enhancing the active participation of the poor" among others by supporting (self-) employment potentials of youth,
- "guaranteeing basic social services – strengthening social protection", among others through HIV/AIDS prevention,
- "fostering gender equality",
- "ensuring the participation of the poor – strengthening good governance", and
- "resolving conflict peacefully – fostering human security and disarmament".<sup>6</sup>

---

<sup>4</sup> United Nations 2000: The role of the United Nations in the 21st century:25-26

<sup>5</sup> La Cava/Lytle 2003:32

<sup>6</sup> Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development 2001: Poverty reduction – a global responsibility. Program of Action 2015. Bonn

*Action Programme 2015* particularly stresses the importance of promoting the participation of children and youth, advancing their potential and overcoming social exclusion and a lack of perspective. In order to integrate youth promotion in its policy, GTZ introduced the *Thematic Area Youth*. Youth projects and programmes supported by the GTZ focus on areas such as health, formal and non-formal education, employment, peace education and conflict prevention. Youth are regarded as agents for social change, economic development, technological innovation, as well as partners in development cooperation.<sup>7</sup>

### **Approaches to reduce youth poverty in South Africa**

The evaluation 'Approaches to reduce youth poverty in Cape Town, South Africa' is one of four in the series evaluation on 'Combating Youth Poverty'. It included government and non-government projects and programmes geared explicitly to youth as a target group, and aimed at determining the development approaches, instruments, and methods most suitable to facilitating the immediate reduction of poverty amongst youth, and how to support the latter as active participants in poverty reduction. The evaluation compiled, analysed and assessed relevant experience (lessons learnt) to point the way forward for the conceptual design of youth development approaches and their assimilation into BMZ sector policy.

The objectives of the series evaluation, formulated by the BMZ and supplemented by preparatory session results from 5th May 2002, were to analyse and assess goals and achievements of the projects and programmes, their results, and their intentional and unintentional impacts, such as:

- contribution to the sustainable reduction of youth poverty and the prevention/management of conflicts and violence in urban areas,
- appropriateness of development approaches in terms of meeting needs, sustainability, and broad-based poverty reduction (good and best practices, lessons learnt),
- effectiveness of innovative methods in youth work,
- effectiveness of HIV/AIDS mainstreaming,
- opportunities for youth participation in decision-making processes at different levels and obstacles to their participation, accounting for gender aspects,
- adequacy of the institutional set-up, coordination and cooperation between projects, specification of cooperation weaknesses, and recommendations for improvements,
- strengths and weaknesses of governmental and non-governmental organisations,

---

<sup>7</sup> GTZ 2002: Zukunft gestalten – Jugend als Partner. Jahresbericht 2002. Eschborn

- analysis of the methods applied for ascertaining impacts and for monitoring and evaluation, practical recommendations for improvements, particularly for the project supported by the GTZ,
- recommendations for conceptual development in combating youth poverty, for BMZ programmes and priority policy-making based on analysis and assessment, and
- sustainability of measures.

### Projects under review

The following organisations and projects in the Cape Town area and in Soshanguve/Pretoria were evaluated:

- *Urban Conflict Management Project (UCMP)*, previously entitled *Peace and Development Project Western Cape* (GTZ Project no. 99.2126.3, 02.2482.4), with project locations in Nyanga-Crossroads/Cape Town and Soshanguve/Pretoria,
- *Work Opportunity Programme, Kolping Society South Africa*, supported by *Sozial- und Entwicklungshilfe des Kolpingwerks (SEK)*
- Promotion of youth social work by *Catholic Welfare and Development (CWD)*, a project supported by *Caritas International*,
- *Salesian Institute* projects for street youth supported by *Caritas International*.

An *Evangelischer Entwicklungsdienst (EED)* supported community centre entitled the *New World Foundation*, was included as a reference project.

Each of the evaluated projects implemented a broad array of measures. In addition to poverty reduction, the evaluation therefore focused on the following thematic components that figure in all projects: conflict prevention and management, preparation for employment, vocational and technical education, promotion of self-confidence through life-skills training, and HIV/AIDS mainstreaming.

### Research methods

During the preparatory phase in Berlin, the team evaluated project documents, discussed literature relevant to the analysis of youth poverty in South Africa, organised interviews with resource persons and developed the methodological concept for the study. As part of an *Inception Report* on behalf of the BMZ, hypotheses on project and programme impact were formulated on four levels: target groups, implementing/executing agencies, sector youth policies, South African society. Main hypotheses were:

- The projects and programmes have an impact on target group level (project participants, communities). Impact measurement even on this level is difficult because of the multitude of influencing factors outside planned interventions.

- All evaluated organisations and projects increased their capacities for the implementation of projects to reduce youth poverty in the last years.
- The projects and programmes have an impact on society and youth sector level as part of the efforts to transform the South African society, however, particularly on these levels large attribution gaps exist.

The following research methods were applied during the fieldwork phase in South Africa:

- interviews with resource persons, i.e., officials of the *Department of Community Safety, South African Police Service*, academics from the *University of Cape Town*, and representatives of NGOs (18 interviews),
- participant observation (visits to youth and community centres, participation in courses, workshops, and project activities),
- evaluation of training manuals and other project documents,
- interviews with project coordinators and project staff, social workers, teachers, workshop instructors, volunteers and facilitators using semi-structured questionnaires and interview guidelines (45 interviews),
- individual and group interviews with current and former course participants (semi-structured and biographical interviews, 70 interviews),
- discussions and workshops with current and former course participants, including the elaboration of resource and mind maps, and
- interviews with community members of Nyanga/Crossroads (21 interviews).

The interviews with young people and community members of Nyanga/Crossroads were carried out with the assistance of Soyiso Mtemekwana. Other major information bases were two one-day workshops that the evaluation team organised with representatives of the projects and programmes under review. In the first of these, participants discussed methods of impact assessment and monitoring methods (20.8.2003). In the second, the initial draft of the evaluation report was discussed with representatives of the organisations and projects and other resource persons (22.10.2003).

## 2 Summary

### 2.1 Summary of major findings

#### Project description

##### **Kolping Society South Africa (KSA)**

The *Kolping Society*, a catholic, lay membership organisation, was founded in Germany in 1849 and established in other countries later on. *Kolping South Africa (KSA)*

was initiated in 1952 as part of the *International Kolping Society* (IKS). The aim of *Kolping Society South Africa* (KSA) is to develop “family-like groups to empower people to reach their full potential”.<sup>8</sup> *Families* are expected to identify and address needs in a specific community; therefore, their activities are depending on local problems. There are currently 37 *Kolping Families* in South Africa, with between ten and 80 members respectively.

In addressing the high unemployment rate among young people and in order to develop their potential, KSA established the *Work Opportunity Programme* (WOP) in 1998. The expressed goal of WOP is to support participants until they find gainful employment; the main tools are teaching life- and vocational/technical skills. The *Work Opportunity Programme* participants are assisted by *Kolping Families*, but are also encouraged to join *Families* themselves or form new ones to support other members of the community.<sup>9</sup>

### **Catholic Welfare and Development (CWD) and Youth Unlimited (YU)**

*Catholic Welfare and Development (CWD)* was founded in 1972 and constitutes the official welfare and development arm of the Catholic Archdiocese of Cape Town. With its head office based in the city centre, CWD serves as an umbrella organisation for 22 programmes, mainly in marginalised communities with black and coloured populations. CWD runs eight community development centres with social services such as

- community kitchens, care for the aged, nursery schools, and refugee shelter programmes,
- counselling (individual and group), advice on sexual abuse, domestic violence, or HIV/AIDS,
- capacity-building and personal empowerment, especially for youth.

CWD efforts for poverty reduction are closely related to the development of a stable social community infrastructure. Services are provided for all age groups, regardless of confessional background. The CWD youth programmes are split up into four focus areas:

- sports and recreation,
- arts and culture,
- life-skills and HIV/AIDS prevention, and
- economic empowerment.

Due to the large number of programmes CWD encompasses, the focus of the evaluation is on the following youth programmes: the *Ikhwesi Lomso* and *Ravensmead* youth centres, the *Jobstart* and *Facing the Future with Courage* training programmes, and *Youth Unlimited*.

---

<sup>8</sup> Interview with Bernhard Kohler, May 2003

<sup>9</sup> Interviews with KSA staff and Board members, August 2003

*Youth Unlimited* (YU) is designed to coordinate the youth programmes of CWD, the *Salesian Institute* and the *Catholic Archdiocesan Youth Commission*, and to network with other organisations. Founded in 2002, YU targets “youth living on the streets and youth at risk in the Cape Town Cosmopolitan Area” to “enable them to become fulfilled, independent, integrated and responsible members of society”.<sup>10</sup> YU carries out its own programmes, focusing on sport events that bring youth from different communities together.

### **Salesian Institute (SI)**

The Salesian Order is a Catholic international society engaged in the education and rehabilitation of the most disadvantaged youth, irrespective of religious faith. It was founded in 1854 by the Italian priest Father Giovanni Bosco (Don Bosco). In Cape Town, the *Salesian Institute* (SI) took up its work in 1896. Since 1990, the *Salesian Institute* has run a programme for the re-integration of street children and youth into society, and contains the projects *Learn to Live*, *Don Bosco Hostel / School for Life*, and *Sixteen+ Outreach*.

*Learn to Live* is a school for children and youth who have dropped out of school and lived or currently live on the street. For street children or those who inhabit one of the various shelters throughout the city, basic numeracy and literacy skills are offered in five classes, while the more advanced students participate in *Adult Basic Education Training* (ABET), at the end of which they receive a certificate. The programme also includes dance classes, sports activities, and recreation. Technical training for youth over 16 years of age is an additional element of the project, and includes metalwork, bricklaying, and carpentry.

*Don Bosco Hostel / School for Life* is an 18-month residential programme that includes formal education (ABET), life-skills, and technical skills training for male youth over 16 years of age. The 18 months are divided into three phases: ‘settling’, ‘work preparation’, and ‘independence/preparing to leave’. At the end of each phase, the youth redefine their aims in a ‘refocus camp’.

*Sixteen+* is mainly an outreach project for male street youth over 16 years of age. A streetworker builds up relationships with youth on the streets. He also mediates between youth and police and security and brings youth leaders together. Interested youth are offered a 10-day wilderness camp, after which they are assessed and selected for the *Don Bosco Hostel*. Four times a year the project offers a three-day motivation and reflection outreach camp for street youth, youth leaders, and child prostitutes.

### **New World Foundation (NWF)**

*The New World Foundation* (NWF) was founded in 1980 and started with a nursery school for 27 children in an informal settlement in Vrygrond. In the beginning the organisation focused its activities on childcare, social work and self-help approaches.

---

<sup>10</sup> Interview with Wayne Golding, August 2003

NWF set new priorities with the political transition after 1990. The organisation shifted its focus to empowerment approaches that encourage citizens "to take their rightful place in the new democracy".<sup>11</sup> Currently, the NWF is a multi-purpose community centre that offers various programmes for inhabitants of Lavender Hill, Seawinds, Vrygrond, Steenberg, and Retreat. It addresses social problems with a variety of activities, including a nursery school for 200 children between two and six years of age. NWF provides training in three areas: life-skills, technical skills, and career-search skills. One training programme that targets youth in particular is the three-month *Workplace Skills Course*. It includes modules on life-skills, computer skills, communication, time management, and conflict resolution, as well as a job-shadowing programme.

To optimise the impact of its programmes, NWF is currently intensifying activities for community empowerment through capacity-building and the strengthening of civil society structures. To this end it participated in the foundation of the *Lavender Hill Development Forum* in June 2003. The civil society forum consists of representatives from NGOs, local government, the police, small-scale businesses, religious organisations, and other concerned individuals and groups in Lavender Hill and the surrounding areas. It aims at community capacity-building, lobbying, and combating gang violence. The member organisations/institutions form different sectors thought to be relevant to the development of the community (youth, business, education, gender, social development, religion, sports, culture, and environment).<sup>12</sup>

### **Urban Conflict Management Project (UCMP)**

The *Urban Conflict Management Project* (UCMP) seeks to react to the high levels of crime and violence in South African communities and offers training for young people. UCMP began in 1997 as the *Peace and Development Project* (PDP), a crime prevention strategy in Nyanga/Crossroads. It was designed as a collaborative measure between the *South African Department of Safety and Security* and the *German Ministry of Foreign Affairs*. In 1999, a second project location was established in Soshanguve near Pretoria (Gauteng Province). The *German Agency for Technical Cooperation* (GTZ) has been supporting the project since the year 2000. There are plans to extend it to other townships and regions.

The project is comprised of two components, the first of which consists of voluntary work by *Community Peace Workers* (CPWs), who practice peaceful methods of mediating and handling conflicts. The CPWs are young men and women from the communities between the age of 18 and 30, the majority of whom are in their early and mid-twenties. They patrol in the community, accompany mass events, such as funerals and demonstrations, provide First Aid, ensure that pensioners arrive home safely after picking up their *Old Age Grants*, or provide traffic-guidance for school children. Additionally, community residents can report their cases directly to the UCMP offices.

---

<sup>11</sup> NWF 2002: Progress and planning reports 2002/2003:3

<sup>12</sup> Interviews with NWF staff, August 2003

In cases of heavy crime, such as rape, murder, or armed conflicts CPWs call the police and the ambulance.

CPWs deal with approximately 67 to 200 different cases per month, mostly family, neighbour and property disputes. Some cases involve the abuse of children and women, child neglect, and domestic violence. Peace workers operate in small groups of six to eight people in morning and afternoon shifts during the week, with additional night shifts at weekends.<sup>13</sup>

The second component of the project consists of skills training for CPWs at the beginning, during and at the end of their service. Most peace workers have completed secondary school, but their qualification is largely inadequate for successful job applications. According to interview information, the main cause of failure is insufficient skills in mathematics and English. To fill these gaps, CPWs are provided with a bridging programme for business English, mathematics, computer training and career-guidance. After a one-year service as CPWs, participants get the opportunity take up a professional training or an apprenticeship. UCMP staff assist in contacting with potential employers.<sup>14</sup>

### **General conditions**

One of the major challenges facing the new South African government in 1994 was the extent of poverty and inequality created by the apartheid regime. Since then, the government has introduced remarkable political and legislative reforms; however, social and economic inequalities have changed less than was expected by discriminated groups and as announced in political programmes. Currently, about half of the South African population lives in absolute poverty. The South African Constitution grants citizens fundamental social rights, which include equality, security, access to adequate housing, health care and education. However, a large part of the population is still excluded from basic social rights. Although it is estimated that eleven percent of the country's population are infected with HIV/AIDS, for instance, many people could not exercise their right of access to health care, as the government refused until recently to recognise the dramatic scale of the illness.

At the beginning of the post-apartheid era, optimistic expectations prevailed as to the possibilities of addressing the problems of poverty and distribution. The *Reconstruction and Development Programme* of 1994 documents the expectations for fast socio-economic transformation. The priorities listed are the alleviation of poverty, the creation of employment opportunities, and the democratising and restructuring of

---

<sup>13</sup> Interviews with project staff, August 2003

<sup>14</sup> Interviews with UCMP staff, August 2003

state institutions. In 1996, the South African government adopted a strategy for *Growth, Employment and Redistribution* (GEAR) that confirmed and stressed market and economic growth-oriented strategies. While GEAR is also dedicated to the broader goal of poverty alleviation, the implementation of stringent fiscal deficit targets has set tight restrictions on government spending. Its implementation is regarded as highly controversial. Organisations such as the *Congress of South African Trade Unions* (COSATU), the *South African Council of Churches* (SACC) and the *South African NGO Coalition* (SANGOCO) criticised the down-sizing of the public service and the cutbacks in social services within the framework of GEAR as having exacerbated the situation of the poor.

There is a broad consensus in South African society that crime is a severe obstacle to political and economic development. The government has acknowledged the relevance of reducing violence and crime through the implementation of programmes such as the *National Crime Prevention Strategy*, which aims at coordinating the activities of various departments involved in crime control and prevention, or the *Domestic Violence Act*. However, the enforcement of legislation and implementation of new strategies appears difficult. Insecurity remains a specific characteristic of poverty in South Africa. A violent environment poses a risk for the success of all evaluated youth projects and programmes.

While the educational system in the apartheid era was used as an instrument of discrimination, it is now considered a key factor for reducing social inequality and poverty. However, although the South African government spends a considerable portion of the national budget on education, the wide gaps in access to and quality of education along racially-defined and regional lines could not be bridged. Since 1994, the South African government has been in the process of reforming the system of skills and vocational training. Essential to these reforms are the *Skills Development Levies* and the *National Qualification Framework* (NQF), a system of education and training with qualifications on eight levels, for which national standards have been defined. As the various levels are split into modules, the system enables 'life-long' learning. The *Skills Development Levies* are used as a source of finance to promote reforms in the skills and vocational training system.

Since 1994, the South African government has developed several strategies to reduce youth poverty. In June 1996, the *National Youth Commission* (NYC) was established as part of a government plan to develop a comprehensive youth policy. The *National Youth Policy* constitutes the framework for coordinating the work of government departments and agencies as well as civil society organisations and the private sector. It proposes intervention areas for the mainstreaming of youth issues, i.e., poverty reduction, access to information, education and training, economic participa-

tion and empowerment, justice and safety. However, it is difficult to assess the achievements in youth policy coordination and coherence and the creation of synergy effects. Whether the strategies were able to contribute to the reduction of youth poverty must remain a subject for long-term impact analysis.

Considering the high rate of youth poverty and unemployment and the size and scope of the organisations and projects evaluated, it is clear that they can only have a limited impact on the overall situation. However, they currently complement the public educational and training systems; for youth in the former townships the training programmes provide a link to formal and informal labour markets. Reforms of the skills and vocational training system have a potential effect on the improvement and expansion of training carried out by NGOs, as they provide new opportunities to receive funding. The NQF also permits flexibility in the case of poor youth, as training can be interrupted by periods of work in order to finance additional education.

### **Quality of the aims and planning of the projects**

The planning of the projects and programmes covered in this report can be generally characterised as process and action-oriented. In qualitative assessments, the organisations and projects analyse needs in close contact to community members or - in the case of the *Salesian Institute* - to street children and youth. Only YU, NWF and UCMP applied the logical framework to document the planning process. Recently structured participative needs assessments were carried out in particular by NWF.

All organisations have similar overall aims: empowerment of individuals and communities, poverty reduction, decrease of unemployment, social stability, and the improvement of the livelihood of the population in low-income urban areas. KSA, CWD, SI and NWF adopted a holistic approach with activities on several levels, without clearly formulating priorities.

Main project aims of the training programmes are to provide vocational/technical and life-skills training, to support participants in finding gainful employment, and to raise their self-esteem and improve their social skills. A further aim of the *Salesian Institute* is the re-integration of street youth into their families and communities. The target groups of all organisations under review are young people from marginalised areas of the Cape Town region or more generally, from a poor background. Most efforts are primarily geared to improving the situation of the individual. NWF and UCMP, in particular, include conflict transformation approaches that target communities, in order to enlarge security in the former townships.

The organisations and projects evaluated react with their activities to current problems that contribute to youth poverty, such as the high unemployment rate and large incidence of crime and violence in the former townships. In the case of KSA, CWD and SI, however, the planning process is documented to a minor extent only. This is less important for the present training courses, but if organisations plan to extend their activities or apply for further funding, a more structured or at least more documented planning procedure should be considered. The logical framework only seems to be suitable in a version adapted to planning needs of the organisations. The confusion caused by the use of terminology that formulates future aims as if they were achievements and already a fact was expressed in the interviews.

### **Quality of project implementation and steering**

The life-skills courses and technical/vocational training programmes provided by the different organisations and projects attain high standards. A variety of teaching methods are applied appropriate to the respective topics and target groups. Continuous evaluation allows for quality control, assessment of user-friendliness, and the integration of specific needs and interests. Relevant elements of life-skills courses include teaching personal and social skills, conflict management and transformation, as well as business and job-search skills. A period of job-shadowing at institutions or private companies, as is encouraged by KSA, CWD/*Jobstart* and NWF, is assessed to be of significance in conveying practical experience. Former trainees assessed career guidance and aftercare as helpful to finding employment.

The youth and community centres of CWD, NWF and the *Salesian Institute* offer various programmes considered appropriate to meet the needs and interests of young people, such as sports, and cultural and recreational activities. The *Salesian Institute* provides outdoor activities in camps outside Cape Town (wilderness therapy). All organisations and projects integrate HIV/AIDS prevention in their youth programmes. To enlarge their capacities and ensure high standards, they mostly work in cooperation with specialised NGOs and government agencies.

In the organisations and projects under review, steering involves exchange of information and experience between the organisations in South Africa, their international or German partners, and local counterparts. Formalised procedures and informal personal cooperation and contacts are relevant for planning, the formulation of strategies, and implementation processes. Within the organisations and projects, frequent meetings on different levels allow for immediate responses to the specific requirements of decision making. As a means of optimising the use of resources and creating synergy effects, partnerships and the exchange of information have become

relevant factors in the implementation and steering of projects in recent years. Each of the evaluated organisations and projects has partnerships with NGOs, training institutions, and government agencies.

All organisations and projects monitor their activities regularly and record data such as the number of courses and participants. UCMP compiles monthly statistics with an overview on the number and type of cases *Community Peace Workers* (CPW) were involved in, how they were solved, and whether they were reported or transferred to the police or other organisations and institutions. KSA, CWD/*Jobstart*, NWF and UCMP use the number of students finding a job in the formal or informal sector as an indicator for the success and impact of their training programmes. Questionnaires and interview guidelines for tracer studies combine quantitative and qualitative aspects. Their statistics contain information on whether and where former students have found work. The *Salesian Institute* additionally keeps records on the number of children and youth that have re-entered mainstream schools and passed examinations, the number of youth returning home, and the drop-out rate. All staff members interviewed, consider their student course evaluations as a relevant impact measurement of personal gains. The results of the tracer studies and the assessments of students provide organisations and projects with a basis for further project planning, implementation, and steering.

The tracer studies are adequate instruments for measuring the impact of training courses on employment opportunities. In estimating the extent to which the life-skills courses or the acquirement of social skills have contributed to a rise in self-esteem, so far, the qualitative self-assessment of participants seems to be the most suitable indicator. However, to measure the impact of projects and programmes that target local communities as a whole, such as UCMP or a large number of young people, such as the youth centres, is not an easy task. To gain at least an impression of changes possibly induced by the implementation of projects, a study should be carried out in the planning phase with the definition of indicators for the measurement of change. In the case of UCMP participatory conflict analyses should be part of the planning process. This could contribute to the adaptation of the work of the CPWs to location specific conditions, to an increase of their acceptance in the community and to the creation of a base for networking with other civil society organisations.

### **Development-policy effectiveness and significance of the projects**

The organisations and projects under review have a strong orientation and holistic approach towards the reduction of youth poverty. Their general policies and strategies comply with the internationally agreed aims as documented in the *Millennium*

*Development Goals and Agenda 21* such as employment creation, HIV/AIDS prevention, participation in decision-making processes, and peaceful conflict resolution. This also conforms with the *BMZ Action Programme 2015*. The community and youth centres and the training offers supplied by the organisations and projects reach a large number of young people with self-help and empowerment approaches.

According to project and programme statistics, most training programme participants have found employment (between 64 and 84 percent). How far a reduction of youth poverty has been achieved, is, however, difficult to assess, as it has not been recorded whether employment is permanent or temporary. In addition, no details are available on whether former course participants earn sufficient income or have merely become a part of the so-called working poor. In the South African context of enormous youth unemployment rates, the provision of training to increase opportunities on the labour market is a relevant strategic approach. However, given the capacities of the programmes and projects, they can only provide a small contribution to solving the overall structural problems of poverty and unemployment.

Life-skills courses seem to be a particularly suitable instrument to increase young people's chances for the integration into the formal or informal labour market, as well as their participation in decision-making processes. In general, providing space for young people in the form of youth and community centres is perceived as an important integration strategy. The organisation of outdoor camps, and cultural and sports events is often the first step towards the inclusion of street children and youth at risk.

Capacity-building for conflict and crime prevention aims at solving crucial problems in the current South African situation. In this respect, the UCMP approach of combining training for young people with a voluntary peace service can be considered innovative. The impact of UCMP on lowering the levels of crime and violence is, however, difficult to estimate. Community members and police officials appreciate the presence of CPWs but pointed out the complexity of the problems in former townships that give rise to specific forms of violence and crime, on which the peace workers have little or no influence. The development of UCMP into a two-component programme may have a long-term conceptual problem. In the context of extending the project to other locations, the danger of overburdening peace workers with the relatively long time of voluntary service and the confrontation with violent situations should be assessed.

Through continuous learning processes, all organisations and projects increased capacities relevant to sustainability, including contacts to government agencies, education and training institutions, as well as private companies. The reduction of poverty and inequality is among the major challenges facing South Africa in the coming years, or even decades. In the transformation phase, organisations and projects such

as KSA, CWD, SI, YU, NWF and UCMP have an important role in contributing to awareness in communities and government agencies of the problems and potential of youth, of the deficits in education and training opportunities, and of relevant topics such as conflict transformation and HIV/AIDS prevention.

## **2.2 Summary of major recommendations**

### **2.2.1 Project-related recommendations**

If not otherwise indicated, recommendations apply to all organisations and projects in South Africa.

#### **Networking, coordination and sharing of resources**

There is a growing awareness of the potential benefits and synergy effects of cooperating with organisations and institutions active in youth policies and projects. However, efforts were generally made to establish networks with organisations that provide supplementary services rather than to those working in the same field. In the two workshops carried out in Cape Town during the evaluation period, representatives of KSA, CWD, SI, YU, NWF and UCMP expressed plans to create a forum in order to achieve synergy effects in the reduction of youth poverty and make a more significant impact. It is recommended that the coordination of work done by the evaluated organisations and others in the same field, including the sharing of resources (expertise and human resources, training material and premises etc.) and an exchange of information and experiences should be increased.

To create further synergy effects, cooperation and coordination with government agencies involved in educational and youth policies, with private businesses in a position to provide funding and employment, as well as with NGOs that provide counselling and mentoring services should be extended.

As all organisations offer life-skills courses in different programmes, an exchange of concepts and experience is highly recommended. The idea is to gain from the experience and methodological frameworks of others and to improve and adapt the training modules continuously. Standardisation is regarded as useful in achieving official recognition by government institutions.

As all projects are currently in the process of intensifying their cooperation with the *Department of Labour* and the *Sectoral Education and Training Authorities* to gain official recognition for training offers such as life-skills courses within the *National Qualification Framework*, as well as access to funds from the skills levy, it is recom-

mended that a discussion round should be organised to share ideas on how to overcome bureaucratic hurdles.

### **Planning and implementation**

Where entire communities or larger numbers of young people are targeted, for example with the establishment of youth centres, it is recommended that more formalised need analyses should be carried out before implementing new projects and programmes. UCMP should integrate a *Peace and Conflict Impact Assessment* into the planning of extension to other project locations. This seems especially significant as a basis to measure future impact. It is recommended that an external facilitator should develop a concept adapted to the requirements of UCMP.

As quite a number of programmes on HIV/AIDS prevention already exist, UCMP should leave this topic to specialised NGOs and institutions. Instead, it should develop a 'conflict groundbreaker' profile for peace workers.

### **Target groups**

Apart from the *Salesian Institute*, all projects and programmes have a high percentage of girls and young women among the participants. Special needs and interests that could be targeted in training or in girls-to-girls peer education should be considered. Additionally, counselling on domestic violence and sexual abuse, as well as leadership training should also be taken into account. A systematic gender-mainstreaming approach should be applied in all projects and programmes.

As South African society is highly fragmented, all projects should continue to encourage the participation of youth from various backgrounds and especially from disadvantaged groups, such as youth from informal settlements, refugees and street youth. Furthermore, 'outdoor programmes' and transport facilities should be provided as a means of letting them 'see the outside world'.

### **Improving existing impact monitoring and assessment**

To enhance existing impact monitoring and assessment, it is recommended that programme and project goals formulated in very general terms should be refocused.

Each of the evaluated organisations and projects has begun to develop systems for impact monitoring and assessment. Similarities and differences of the various systems should be further discussed to enable the implementation of general improvements and the development of common standards.

To assess the achievement of employment-related training programmes, follow-up statistics should include information on the kind of work found, duration of contracts, as well as an estimate of the income level.

Participants agreed at the impact workshop that the coordination and sharing of resources in relation to impact monitoring is of considerable importance. However, it was also mentioned that a lack of capacity poses a constraint on these efforts. It is recommended that all organisations should continue to develop their impact monitoring systems, with the facilitation of either an external NGO or persons in the organisations with the appropriate knowledge and skills. This requires additional funds or a reduction in work load, allowing staff more time to engage in impact monitoring. It is also crucial to make sure that legitimacy for this monitoring resource unit is ensured for those involved.

### **2.2.2 Conclusions for development policy**

Poverty in South Africa is a multidimensional problem. In order to contribute to the reduction of youth poverty, German development cooperation should support approaches on different levels and cooperate with government agencies and NGOs. Following recommendations are either directed to particular actors or constitute more general conclusions for conceptual development in reducing youth poverty.

#### **Better linkage with national poverty reduction strategies and international goals**

With RDP, the South African government committed itself to strategies for poverty reduction on different levels that are in compliance with international goals such as the *Millennium Development Goals*. Fiscal restraints as a result of GEAR, however, have caused setbacks in implementation. In order to contribute to a coherent poverty reduction policy in the current transformation phase, BMZ and GTZ should support objectives and strategies of the South African government as they are expressed in RDP. To monitor present government policies, initiatives such as the 'People's Budget' from COSATU, SACC and SANGOCO should be supported particularly by NGOs such as SEK, *Caritas International* and EED. For lobby policies and the discussion of a 'poverty-sensitive' budget, regular research and public hearings should be organised to provide insights into the allocation of public expenditure and its potential impact on poverty and inequality. In the discussion of a poverty-sensitive budget, special attention should be given to differences in the experience of poverty

between and within social groups. Data should be disaggregated into categories such as age, gender and ethnic group.

### **Conceptual development in reducing youth poverty**

Following recommendations are addressed to German development cooperation in general (BMZ, GTZ, and NGOs) and should be considered in all projects and programmes.

Executing and implementing organisations working on the reduction of youth poverty should follow holistic approaches that also target families and communities. Organisations need to be flexible to be able to adapt to changing conditions. The creation of voluntary structures to support project staff is also recommendable. Community centres working with youth should be located close to the target group.

As most South African former townships – similar to low income quarters in cities in other African countries, Latin America and Asia – show a lack of areas for leisure activities and communication the promotion of specific youth-friendly spaces is recommended. There is a need for parks, sports fields, playgrounds, places and equipment for drama and music, and holiday programmes. The creation of youth-friendly spaces can become an effective instrument in promoting young people's talent and creative potential. Sports and cultural activities are important 'pull factors' in motivating young people to join other programmes. Urban planning that integrates the needs of youth can contribute to inclusion and empowerment.

As girls and young women are discriminated in many societies, systematic gender-mainstreaming should be part all projects in the youth sector as well as of programme planning, implementation, monitoring and evaluation.

### **Conclusions and recommendations on procedures and instruments**

Life-skills courses combining training in communication, and conflict prevention and transformation are adequate instruments to strengthen young people's capacities. SEK, *Caritas International*, EED, and GTZ should continue to support their local partners in the development and adaptation of methods and content of training programmes. As life-skills education is considered an important element for the advancement of young people, it is suggested that courses should be extended to include schools in order to reach a greater number of children and youth. BMZ and GTZ should continue to support government agencies and schools to develop appropriate curricula.

Donor agencies that consider impact monitoring and assessment significant should be aware of support needs. Investments in the training of staff and the introduction of appropriate impact monitoring systems are perceived as investments in long-term cost effectiveness. SEK, *Caritas International*, EED, and GTZ should reserve a certain amount of funds to enable an adequate impact monitoring throughout the project or programme phase.

The introduction of general minimum standards for impact monitoring and evaluation is necessary to increase the exchange of experiences among organisations and institutions working in the youth sector, as well as to facilitate national, regional and international comparisons. Additionally, needs assessments should be part of planning procedures. SEK, *Caritas International*, EED, and GTZ should assist their local partners to develop and apply instruments for impact monitoring and participatory needs assessments.

An impact monitoring system should include negative and unintended impacts as well, taking into account the overall context. It should also be considered that, as impacts are effective after a certain time-lag their measuring should be planned at appropriate intervals. The development of indicators is of specific relevance to the improvement of impact monitoring. To formulate indicators that are operationally feasible, SEK, *Caritas International*, EED, and GTZ should support their local partners with workshops or/and external facilitators.

### **2.3 Main conclusions and lessons learnt**

Until now no systematic overview on extent and forms of youth poverty in South Africa exists. BMZ and GTZ should find out how efforts of government agencies, research institutions and NGOs to establish a comprehensive data base on poverty in South Africa can be supported (for instance by a joint effort of bi- and multilateral organisations present in South Africa). It is recommended that comparable and complementary reporting systems for different countries and regions that provide clearly defined indicators for youth poverty and well-being should be designed, so as to achieve a holistic picture on influencing factors and ensure a systematic analysis of change.

For a significant and sustainable reduction of youth poverty, cooperation between government agencies, NGOs, civil society structures, and communities is required. Thus the dialogue between researchers, NGOs, community representatives, development initiatives, and policy-makers should be intensified and coordinated. German development cooperation (BMZ, GTZ, and NGOs) should support existing networks.

Self-employment often appears as an alternative in a situation of stagnating or decreasing employment opportunities in the formal sector. However, providing advisory

services or organising credit programmes for young people should be based on realistic assessments of the absorptive capacities of the small, medium and micro-enterprises sector (SMME). BMZ and GTZ should carry out a study assessing the potential of the micro-scale enterprise sector that can be of particular importance for young people.

The following conclusions and recommendations are addressed to German development cooperation in general and should be considered in all projects and programmes (BMZ, GTZ, and NGOs).

Youth projects and programmes are exceedingly relevant to addressing specific forms of poverty among young people, such as high unemployment and exclusion from decision-making processes. For activities such as training and education, it seems adequate to follow the policy of the South African government and extend the term 'youth' to the age of 35, in order to include disadvantaged persons and groups. The definition of more narrow age limits may, on the other hand, be more appropriate for other activities.

The concept mainstreaming was developed in the field of women and gender studies. Gender mainstreaming is defined as "the process of assessing the implications for women and men of any planned action, including legislation, policies or programmes, in any areas and at all levels. It is a strategy for making the concerns and experiences of women as well as of men an integral part of the design, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of policies and programmes in all political, economic and societal spheres, so that women and men benefit equally, and inequality is not perpetuated."<sup>15</sup> Referring to the question of whether youth should be made a cross-cutting / mainstreaming theme, it is recommended that an – in analogy to the gender debate - 'age mainstreaming' or 'generation mainstreaming' rather than a 'youth mainstreaming' approach should be applied. This is especially relevant in projects and programmes potentially relevant to young people but also to other age groups, such as urban and community development. The social differentiation of target groups according to age, gender or ethnic group should be analysed in needs assessments and throughout the planning and implementation phase.

To integrate the perspective of children and youth in strategies and policies their participation should become central in research on poverty and well-being. It is recommended that community-based youth organisations and groups should play a key role in the identification of needs at local level to ensure bottom-up approaches, inclusion and participation. Organisations and projects should create opportunities for dialogue to share knowledge with and about young people. Indicators to measure the impact of youth projects and programmes should be identified in cooperation with youth representatives. The creative and innovative potential of youth should be used and integrated at all levels of decision-making processes.

---

<sup>15</sup> ILO Gender Equality Tool ([www.ilo.org/public/english/bureau/gender/newsite2002/about/defin.htm](http://www.ilo.org/public/english/bureau/gender/newsite2002/about/defin.htm), 2.1.2004)

---

Conflict prevention in South Africa is rendered difficult through widespread crime and gang violence. Therefore, apart from capacity-building in communities, it is crucial to address crime and violence on the national level. It is recommended that communities establishing civil society structures to lobby for crime and conflict prevention should be supported.